

RUBRIC DEVELOPMENT

MARCH 4-6 DENVER, CO



OVERVIEW

- I. Introduction to Rubrics
 - A. What is a rubric?
 - B. Why are rubrics useful?
- II. Format of Rubrics and Important Characteristics
- III. Activities and Exercises
- IV. Developing the Rubric



WHAT IS A RUBRIC?

- Rubrics are useful tools to assess performance or learning objectives (i.e., standards).
- Rubrics provide details for each part of a performance task:
 - Scoring criteria
 - Behavioral descriptors for each score category (e.g., “excellent” to “poor”)
- Rubrics are used to assess criteria at different levels of achievement



WHY USE RUBRICS?

- Increased reliability (consistency in scoring)
- Increased validity
- Provide feedback for students and teachers
 - Rubrics provide details about how to improve performance.
 - Rubrics allow students to understand what behavioral outcomes are expected.
- Rubrics make your life easier!



WHY USE RUBRICS?

Example 1:

Please rate the student's presentation. Circle your choice, below.

1	2	3	4
Poor	Fair	Good	Excellent



WHY USE RUBRICS?

Example 2:

Please rate the student's presentation. Circle your choice, below.

Organization	Poor	Fair	Good	Excellent
Knowledge of Topic	Poor	Fair	Good	Excellent
Eye Contact	Poor	Fair	Good	Excellent
Tone of Voice	Poor	Fair	Good	Excellent



WHY USE RUBRICS

Example 3:

Please rate the student's presentation. Circle your choice, below.

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time	Displays some eye contact with the audience but frequently looks at notes	Displays little or no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout entire presentation	X2
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation	Uses appropriate volume and varied pitch, speaks at an understandable pace	Most words are spoken clearly with varied pitch, mostly speaks at an understandable pace	Speaks at a low volume, pitch is not varied, pace is too fast or too slow at times	Speaks too softly to be heard, and too fast or slow too to engage audience, pitch is not varied	X2



FORMAT

Vertical Axis – Scoring Criteria

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time	Displays some eye contact with the audience but frequently looks at notes	Displays no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout entire presentation	X3
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation	Uses appropriate volume and varied pitch, speaks at an understandable pace	Most words are spoken clearly with varied pitch, mostly speaks at an understandable pace	Speaks at a low volume, pitch is not varied, pace is too fast or too slow at times	Speaks too softly to be heard, and too fast or slow too to engage audience, pitch is not varied	X4



FORMAT

Horizontal Axis – Score Categories (performance levels)

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes.	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time	Displays some eye contact with the audience but frequently looks at notes	Displays no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout entire presentation	X3
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation	Uses appropriate volume and varied pitch, speaks at an understandable pace	Most words are spoken clearly with varied pitch, mostly speaks at an understandable pace	Speaks at a low volume, pitch is not varied, pace is too fast or too slow at times	Speaks too softly to be heard, and too fast or slow too to engage audience, pitch is not varied	X4



FORMAT

Intersections of scoring criteria and score categories

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time	Displays some eye contact with the audience but frequently looks at notes.	Displays no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout entire presentation	X3
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation	Uses appropriate volume and varied pitch, speaks at an understandable pace	Most words are spoken clearly with varied pitch, mostly speaks at an understandable pace	Speaks at a low volume, pitch is not varied, pace is too fast or too slow at times	Speaks too softly to be heard, and too fast or slow too to engage audience, pitch is not varied	X4



FORMAT

Weight Axis –level of importance assigned to each scoring criterion

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time	Displays some eye contact with the audience but frequently looks at notes	Displays no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout entire presentation	X3
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation	Uses appropriate volume and varied pitch, speaks at an understandable pace	Most words are spoken clearly with varied pitch, mostly speaks at an understandable pace	Speaks at a low volume, pitch is not varied, pace is too fast or too slow at times	Speaks too softly to be heard, and too fast or slow too to engage audience, pitch is not varied	X4



IMPORTANT CHARACTERISTICS

- Criteria must be objective; based on observable behaviors
- Rubric should be concise
- Rubric should be easy to use
 - Language should be very clear
 - Language should be written at the appropriate grade level (for student feedback)
 - Each score category can easily be distinguished



IMPORTANT CHARACTERISTICS

- The rubric should be understood and agreed upon by different evaluators who will be using the rubric
 - Expectations are common across evaluators
 - Rater training

STARTING THE DEVELOPMENT PROCESS



Source: Smarter Balance Assessment Consortium, Introduction to Evidence-Centered Design



BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Content standard. Choose the content standard that you want to assess.

- Reading, Writing, Communicating
 - Standard 1: Oral Expression and Listening
 - Grade Level Expectation: 11th Grade

Claim. What claim do you want to make about the student?

- Example: Student can use effective nonverbal communication

Assessment Target. What knowledge/skills to assess?

- Example: Student uses effective tone of voice during presentation.

Evidence

- Have the student give a presentation for a particular audience/purpose
- Observe several aspects of students' behavior...we need to specify these behaviors
- Specify the scoring criteria

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Scoring Criteria. What are we interested in assessing?

For our example: nonverbal communication

- Eye contact
- Body language (gestures)
- Tone of voice

Scoring Criteria must be carefully defined

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

- Scoring criteria should be carefully defined
- Examples:
 - Tone of Voice
 - What aspects of 'tone of voice' should be measured?
 - What does effective 'tone of voice' sound like?
 - Body language
 - What does 'body language' entail?
 - What does effective body language look like?

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Sometimes you may want to group behaviors for the scoring criteria

- Example: enunciation, speaking volume, pace, pitch, enthusiasm
- Scoring Criterion: *“Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation”*



BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Place these scoring criteria on the vertical axis.

- The vertical axis shows that:
 - the task is broken down into several different scoring criteria
 - the work is multidimensional
 - there are varying levels of achievement

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Eye Contact

Tone of voice,
pacing, and
pronunciation

Appearance



BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Create the horizontal axis.

- Decide on the number of score categories
- Choose the vocabulary that describes each level (e.g., excellent, good, fair, poor)
 - Sophisticated, Competent, Partly competent, Not yet competent
 - Exemplary, Proficient, Marginal, Unacceptable
 - Advanced, Intermediate, Novice
 - Distinguished, Proficient, Intermediate, Novice
 - Accomplished, Developing, Beginning

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor
	3	2	1	0
Eye Contact				
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation				
Appearance				

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

After outlining scoring criteria and score categories, describe what the **highest** level of performance (i.e., “excellent”) looks like for each behavioral criterion.

Example: Enunciates well, speaks at good volume and pace, varied pitch, passionate about topic

You can also consider including mistakes that should be avoided e.g., “Student avoids the use of interjections throughout the presentation (e.g., um, uh, like, etc.)”

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Describe what the **lowest** score category (i.e., “poor”) looks like.

Example: *Quiet and hesitant, lacks passion, speaks with monotone voice, difficult to understand*



BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Contrast the high and low score categories to compile the intermediate categories (i.e., “good” and “fair”) of performance.

Note: Each criterion in a rubric should have the same number of score categories

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor
	3	2	1	0
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes.	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time.	Displays some eye contact with the audience but frequently looks at notes.	Displays no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout the duration of the presentation.
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation	Enunciates well, speaks at good volume and pace, varied pitch, passionate about topic	Fairly clear, may either be rapid or somewhat hesitant to speak, generally easy to understand	Voice wavers, unclear at times, rarely passionate, sometimes difficult to understand	Quiet and hesitant, lacks passion, speaks with monotone voice, difficult to understand
Appearance	Attire is highly professional (e.g., suit, dress with suit jacket). Student is neat and well-groomed.	Attire is professional (e.g., dress pants and button-up shirt). Student is generally neat and well-groomed.	Attire is casual and somewhat neat (e.g., nice jeans with a blouse or dress shirt).	Attire is not appropriate for a presentation (e.g., ripped jeans, sandals, T-shirt, etc.)



BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Decide how important each behavioral criterion is compared to the others and create the weight axis.

- The student's ability to maintain eye contact may be more important than the student's appearance
- Assign a number to each criterion to indicate its importance.

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Review the rubric for consistency. Keep in mind that the same score category descriptors should not appear for multiple scoring criteria.

Example: If you see “student is disengaged” in the Eye Contact criterion as well as the Tone of Voice criterion, points could be deducted from both criteria when they should really only be deducted from one.



BUILDING THE RUBRIC

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact			Student is not engaged with the audience		
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation			Student's voice is not engaging		
Appearance			Attire is casual and somewhat neat (e.g., nice jeans with a blouse or dress shirt)		

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact			Student is not engaged with the audience		
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation			Student's voice is not engaging		
Appearance			Attire is casual and somewhat neat (e.g., nice jeans with a blouse or dress shirt)		

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact				Does not look confidently at the audience	
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation				Quiet and hesitant, lacks passion, speaks with monotone voice, difficult to understand	
Appearance				Is not confident in front of people	

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact				Does not look confidently at the audience	
Tone of voice, pacing, and pronunciation				Quiet and hesitant, lacks passion, speaks with monotone voice, difficult to understand	
Appearance				Is not confident in front of people	

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

- Make sure that, for each scoring criteria, the score category descriptors are mutually exclusive.
- Performance descriptors should not overlap within scoring criteria (i.e., make sure that adjacent categories within a scoring criteria do not include the same behaviors).

BUILDING THE RUBRIC

Find the errors

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time; student looks up frequently	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but sometimes looks at notes; student looks up often	Displays no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout the duration of the presentation	X4



BUILDING THE RUBRIC

What is the difference between these performance descriptors??

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor	
	3	2	1	0	Weight
Eye Contact	Maintains eye contact across the entire audience; rarely looks at notes	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but looks at notes from time to time; student looks up frequently	Maintains eye contact across the audience, but sometimes looks at notes; student looks up often	Displays no eye contact with audience; reads from notes throughout the duration of the presentation	X4



SCORING

- Do the scoring criteria align with Colorado Academic Standards?
- Are the score categories clearly defined?
- To what degree does the rubric address all of the demands within the task?
- Is the rubric designed so that different raters will likely arrive at the same score for a given response?



AM I FINISHED?

“Accomplished Stage”

- The rubric’s content is appropriate and relevant to the task, content standard, etc.
- Emphases seem right
- Categories of the scale make sense
- Important components have been covered adequately and concisely
- The rubric helps you organize your thinking about what counts as quality

(Arter &McTighe, 2001)



AM I FINISHED?

“Developing Stage”

- Some important components are left out
- Balance is questionable
- Rubric could be organized better



AM I FINISHED?

“Beginning Stage”

- Many important components are left out
- The rubrics components are unimportant
- The rubric seems unbalanced
- The rubric seems disorganized in its focus

(Arter &McTighe, 2001)

REFERENCES

- Carlin, N., Rozmus, C., Spike, J., Willcockson, I., Seifert, W., Chappell, C., . . . Boutwell, B. (2011). The health professional ethics rubric: Practical assessment in ethics education for health professional schools. *Journal of Academic Ethics, 9*(4), 277-290.
- Isaacson, J. J., & Stacy, A. S. (2009). Rubrics for clinical evaluation: Objectifying the subjective experience. *Nurse Education in Practice, 9*(2), 134-140.
- Loveland, T. R. (2005). Writing standards-based rubrics for technology education classrooms. *Technology Teacher, 65*(2), 19-30.
- Mertler, Craig A. (2001). Designing scoring rubrics for your classroom. *Practical Assessment, Research & Evaluation, 7*(25).
- Oakleaf, M. (2009). Using rubrics to assess information literacy: An examination of methodology and interrater reliability. *Journal Of The American Society For Information Science & Technology, 60*(5), 969-983. O'Donnell et al., 2011
- Reddy, M. Y. (2011). Design and development of rubrics to improve assessment outcomes. *Quality Assurance in Education, 19*(1), 84-104.
- Arter, J. & McTighe, J. *Scoring Rubrics in the Classroom: Using Performance Criteria for Assessing and Improving Student Performance*. Thousand Oaks, California: Corwin Press, 2001
- Stevens, D.D. and Levi, A.J. (2005). *Introduction to Rubrics*, Stylus, Sterling, VA.